



THIS REPORT CONTAINS ASSESSMENTS OF COMMODITY AND TRADE ISSUES MADE BY USDA STAFF AND NOT NECESSARILY STATEMENTS OF OFFICIAL U.S. GOVERNMENT POLICY

Required Report - public distribution

**Date:** 11/15/2018

**GAIN Report Number:** TR8039

## Turkey

### Agricultural Biotechnology Annual

## Turkey Agricultural Biotechnology Annual Report 2018

**Approved By:**

Elizabeth Leonardi, Agricultural Attaché

**Prepared By:**

Nergiz Ozbag, Sr. Agricultural Specialist

**Report Highlights:**

Ever since Turkey published its Biosafety Law and implementing regulations in 2010, this legislation has continued to disrupt trade and Turkey's domestic agriculture and food sectors. As of October 2018, there are only 36 (10 soybean and 26 corn) events approved for feed use in Turkey. No events are approved for food use or cultivation. Testing of imported products remains inconsistent and continues to be a considerable cost for importers. Following the move to an Executive Presidency in Turkey in 2018, the approval process and authority for biotechnology approvals is being updated as well.

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY:**

There are currently 36 approved genetically engineered (GE) soybean and corn traits allowed to be imported to Turkey for animal feed. The most recent new GE traits were approved in August 2017 and 13 applications are still pending approval. No GE traits have been approved for human food use, so any GE presence in food products is prohibited. For feed, there is a 0.9 percent allowance for low level presence (LLP) of approved events in feed, but zero tolerance for the detection of unapproved GE traits, and a 0.1 percent LLP tolerance in feed for GE traits pending approval in the application process.

Following the presidential elections held on June 24, 2018, the Turkish Government has been re-organized by the Presidency Decree Law 1 on July 10, 2018. Within the scope of the re-organization, Ministry of Food, Agriculture, and Livestock was re-structured by merging with the Ministry of Forestry and Water Affairs, becoming the Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (MinAF). The Decree Law 1 also established nine presidential policy councils. One of these councils is Council of Health and Food Policies, which is responsible for developing biotechnology policies, strategies, and monitoring implementation. Members of the council were appointed in October 2018.

The Biosafety Board, which has been active since 2010, was abolished by the Decree Law 703 on July 9, 2018. MinAF has been authorized to conduct the tasks and responsibilities of the abolished Biosafety Board on August 1, 2018. Until a new process and structure is established, MinAF authorized the former Biosafety Board to continue their previous operations.

Many commodity trading partners in Turkey have encountered import problems due to Turkey's lags in approvals of GE traits compared to other importing and exporting countries (asynchronous approvals) for food and feed. Turkey's very low threshold for pending and unapproved varieties, and lack of approvals of many varieties, has caused uncertainty in the market and disrupted imports. Testing of imported products remains inconsistent and continues to be a considerable cost for importers. The unpredictable situation has increased corporate risk and costs, contributed to high food prices in Turkey and led to increased public suspicion of GE products.

There is much misinformation in the Turkish media about GE products and their safety. This has resulted in a very skeptical public and widespread misunderstanding and fear about agricultural biotechnology.

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

### **CHAPTER 1: PLANT BIOTECHNOLOGY**

PART A: PRODUCTION and TRADE

PART B: POLICY

PART C: MARKETING

### **CHAPTER 2: ANIMAL BIOTECHNOLOGY**

PART D: PRODUCTION and TRADE

PART E: POLICY

PART F: MARKETING

## **ABBREVIATIONS :**

Besd-Bir : Turkish Poultry Meat Procedures and Breeders Association

CPB : Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety

EU : European Union

EPPO : European and Mediterranean Plant Protection Organization

FAS : Foreign Agricultural Service of the United States Department of Agriculture

FAO : Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations

GE : Genetically Engineered

GEF: The Global Environment Facility

HPC : High Planning Council

IPPC : International Plant Protection Convention

LLP : Low Level Presence

MinAF : Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry of the Turkish Republic

NGO : Non-governmental Organization

OECD : Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development

OIE : World Organization for Animal Health

UNEP: United Nations Environment Program

TAGEM : Agricultural Research and Policies General Directorate of Turkey

## **CHAPTER 1: PLANT BIOTECHNOLOGY**

### **PART A: PRODUCTION AND TRADE**

#### **a. PRODUCT DEVELOPMENT:**

There are no GE plants under development for commercial purpose in Turkey.

#### **b. COMMERCIAL PRODUCTION:**

Article 5(1) (c) of the Biosafety Law bans the production of genetically engineered animals and plants. Importation of GE seeds is also forbidden by the Law and by the seed circular, which is usually published every January by MinAF.

#### **c. EXPORTS:**

There is no commercial production of GE crops in Turkey and Turkey does not export GE crops to the United States or other countries, aside from transshipments.

**d. IMPORTS:**

Due to insufficient domestic production and increasing demand, Turkey imports significant quantities of feed crops for its poultry, livestock, and aquaculture sectors. The United States is among the top suppliers to the Turkish market, but imports fluctuate and are affected by the number of GE events approved and measures taken by MinAF (see part B).

Trade in other higher value products such as supplements and pet food were also negatively affected by the impacts of the Biosafety Law, and some non-biotech products were rejected due to presence of GE content, such as dust from GE corn or soy.

Some import violations of the Biosafety Law were prosecuted under the charge of “biological terror” and the accusation of causing harm to Turkey’s agriculture, feed, and food sectors. With the intention of reducing the instances of prosecution for Low Level Presence (LLP) in imports, MinAF amended the implementing regulation of the Biosafety Law to define “contamination” in May 2014. According to some sources, this change appears to have had some impact in reducing overly harsh penalties, such as imprisonment. But domestic poultry/livestock producers using imported feed products are still suffering from the financial burden of a considerable amount of ongoing court cases on issues such as labeling.

In May 2015, MinAF stopped requiring a government attestation for import of enzymes but continues to require a biotech-free/GE-free certificate for the import of microorganisms.

Turkey has approved 26 corn and 10 soybean events for feed use, as of October 20, 2018. No GE traits have been approved for food use, so any GE presence found in food is therefore illegal. Many commodity traders have encountered import problems due to Turkey’s asynchronous approvals for food and feed. Turkey’s demand for protein for the feed sector is increasing each year, thus their soybean requirement is increasing. Trade has been restricted out of concern that dust or minor LLP of GE traits in feed and food products would lead to the rejection of shipments.

Testing of imported products remains inconsistent and continues to be a considerable cost for importers. The unpredictable situation has raised cost for animal feed raw material, increased corporate risk and costs and contributed to increased public suspicion of GE products.

**e. FOOD AID:**

Turkey is not a food aid recipient country. Turkey is currently hosting about 3.6 million refugees, of whom around 180,000 living in refugee camps within Turkey. Most of the aid for refugees within Turkey is distributed through a cash transfer debit card program whereby they procure their own food on the local market. Because of Turkey’s location, it is also a hub for procurement of food assistance for the regional Syrian crisis. Between 2011 and September 2016, the World Food Program procured over \$1.3 billion in food from Turkey. Turkey’s Red Crescent (Kizilay) program also provides food assistance to other countries, particularly in Africa. As no GE products are approved for food use in Turkey and Turkey is not a producer of GE products, food assistance products procured in Turkey would not be GE. Transit of GE products through Turkish ports is allowed but must be permitted through MinAF which is in charge of document checks and monitoring.

## **f. TRADE BARRIERS:**

- Although all GE events approved in Turkey have been approved in the European Union (EU), Turkey has approved fewer GE traits than the EU, causing trade disruptions (as most countries won't export products not already approved in the EU and/or China).
- Turkey has zero tolerance for the detection of unapproved GE traits, except for a 0.1 percent tolerance in feed for GE traits pending approval in the application process.
- The frequency of taking samples and testing them depends on a declaration issued by the competent authority of the loading or origin country which states that the food/feed in question does or does not include GE. Turkey does not accept point of origin testing.
- The Biosafety Law contains severe liability, sanction, and penalty clauses that penalize non-compliance with large fines and five to twelve years in prison.
- Turkey approves traits separately for feed, food, and industrial products, which have led to instances of LLP and prosecution under the Biosafety Law's liability, sanction, and penalty provisions.

The approval process for new traits was based on a risk assessment and socio-economic assessment by the committees under the Biosafety Board. After the Biosafety Board was abolished in July 2018 with responsibilities handed to MinAF, the new approval process has not yet been announced. It may end up resembling the former process. No applications have yet been approved under the new system, and the approval process slowed significantly following the coup-attempt and subsequent investigations in the Turkish government in 2016. The lack of approvals in recent years exacerbates the asynchronous approvals issue, thereby causing problems for Turkish importers and the agriculture sector in Turkey.

## **PART B: POLICY**

### **a. REGULATORY FRAMEWORK:**

Turkey's regulation of agricultural biotechnology is governed by the Biosafety Law (Law No: 5977), implemented on September 26, 2010, and related implementing regulations. Imports of transgenic agricultural products are only allowed after approval of each event for each use; for example: food, feed, industrial (and products for specific industrial applications, such as: lubricant, ink, paint, and biofuel). There are two implementing regulations of the Biosafety Law published on August 13, 2010 by MinAF. These are "Regulation on Genetically Modified Organisms (GMO) and Products" and "Regulation on the Working Principles of the Biosafety Board and the Committees."

The Law bans inclusion of GE ingredients in baby food and supplementary foods for young children, bans cultivation/production of GE plants and animals, and the planting of GE seeds.

Following the adoption of the Biosafety Law in 2010, MinAF established the Biosafety Board to review GE food and feed import applications and nominated the Agricultural Research and Policies General Directorate of Turkey (TAGEM) as the secretariat of the board. It had nine members who were high level bureaucrats from MinAF and other subject-related ministries. The board established two committees which were Risk Assessment and Socio-Economic sub-committees for each application. Members of these committees were from the scientific community such as academia and public research institutes. All application dossiers were assessed by these two parallel committees and the Biosafety Board took the decisions for approval. The board was independent while it was conducting its tasks.

The Biosafety Board was abolished by the Decree Law no 703 published in the Official Gazette on July 9, 2018. MinAF has been authorized to conduct the tasks and responsibilities of abolished Biosafety Board via Presidency Circular published in the Official Gazette on August 1, 2018. MinAF has been working on the new approval process but it has not yet been announced. Until a new Board or/and Committee(s) are established, MinAF authorized the former Biosafety Board to review pending and new (if any) application dossiers. TAGEM has been appointed as the secretariat of the Board during this period.

Following the presidential elections held on June 24, 2018, the Turkish Government itself has been re-organized by the Presidency Decree Law 1, published in the Official Gazette on July 10, 2018. Within the scope of this re-organization, Ministry of Food, Agriculture, and Livestock re-structured by merging with the Ministry of Forest and Water Affairs and became Ministry of Agriculture and Forestry (MinAF). The Decree Law 1 established nine Presidential Policy Councils. One of these councils is Council of Health and Food Policies, which has been given the tasks of developing policies, strategies, and monitoring implementation in the area of biotechnology. The seven members of the Council were announced in the Official Gazette on October 10, 2018. Two are food/agriculture related members and the remainder are health/medical related, such as doctors, dentists, and dietitians. The Council has not yet started to work and its role in the approval process and regulatory framework is not known.

#### *Application process and timeline*

According to the Biosafety Law, either the gene-owning technology companies or importers of GE crops are allowed to submit applications for the approval of a GE event. The Board should inform TAGEM within 90 days whether or not the application is accepted and also the type of evaluation procedure (simplified or regular) which will be followed. TAGEM informs the applicant about the status (whether the application is accepted or not) of the dossier within fifteen days. A request for the simplified review procedure is evaluated by the Biosafety Board. In order to apply under the simplified procedure, besides the rules set by MinAF, the following conditions should be met:

- Taxonomy and biology of the gene source and the receptor live organism should be known.
- Sufficient information should be available regarding the possible effects on human, animal, and environmental health and biological diversity.
- Previous risk assessments that can be used regarding the relations of the GE with other live organisms should not have indicated any negative effects.
- Detailed methods and data should be available to enable the definition of the transferred genetic material and its identification within the live organism where it is transferred.
- The GE product should be approved in the country where it is developed or registered for release into the environment and placed on the market for consumption,
- Authorization of GE product should not be expired in the country where it is developed,
- The results from the previous risk assessments as well as socioeconomic and ethical evaluations should be provided where available.

Unlike the regular procedure, decisions made using the simplified procedure are not published in the Biosafety Clearing House Mechanism of Turkey, which is the web platform for public opinion and information exchange. So the time required for a decision is typically shorter.

Once an application dossier is accepted and a review procedure is determined by the Board, then in principle, the regular procedure reviews are completed within 270 days after that. Note that this time is counted while the Board is doing the assessments. The 270 day clock stops when additional information or documents are requested from the applicant, so in practice, the approval time for an application can take much longer than 270 days. Turkey requires an approval in the country of production before an application can be submitted in Turkey, which makes asynchronous approvals unavoidable.

In the past, MinAF had requested the international companies that have developed agricultural GE traits to submit applications under the Law as quickly as possible in order to avoid trade problems. However, these companies expressed concerns about the severe yet unclear liability provisions in the Law, as well as the vagueness of the application procedures. The liability provisions of the Law include harsh penalties that may involve lengthy jail terms for unspecified “related parties.” It lacks explicit guidance about what documents are required and how the applications will be evaluated. Furthermore, it contains onerous labeling and traceability requirements once the product arrives in Turkey. As a result, Turkish agriculture industry associations have submitted the dossiers instead and paid the application fees so they could import the feed needed for the sector.

#### *Updates to Regulations*

In May 2014, with the intention of reducing the instances of prosecution for LLP in imports, MinAF amended the implementing regulation of the Biosafety Law. It defined “contamination” in a product and established a 0.9 percent threshold under which products are considered “contaminated.” For example, GE feed can be used if the GE trait is under the 0.9 percent threshold and was approved for feed use. However, the amendment does not clearly explain how “contamination” changes the ability to market products or commodities with unapproved GE traits. For detailed information, please see GAIN report [Turkey Amends Biotechnology Regulation](#) dated 5/29/2014.

Beginning in late October 2014, MinAF began requiring a certificate from the producer’s or exporter’s government authority that issues a health certificate (plant health), veterinary health certificate (animal health), or certificate of free sale indicating that for:

“the import of microorganisms, a certificate issued by the authorities of the country of origin or the country of loading or an analysis report issued by an internationally accredited laboratory providing evidence that the microorganism is not genetically modified.”

Turkey also had required a GE-free certificate for enzymes, but on May 5, 2015 that requirement was discontinued.

#### *Strategies and Programs on Biosafety*

The High Planning Council (HPC) of Turkey adopted the “Biotechnology Strategy and Action Plan” in June 2015 to be implemented in the period of 2015-2018. The period of the Plan ended in July 2018. The Plan was the first adopted document which covered all aspects of biotechnology (agricultural, health, industrial) in one document and was owned by a very high-level government authority. The HPC

was chaired by the Prime Minister and the members were from the Cabinet and all interested parties such as related government agencies, private sector and academia. The Plan stated the vision as “to improve the level of technological information, increase the number of products with added value, and take place amongst the leading countries within the field of biotechnology.”

General targets of the plan were:

- to regulate the legal and administrative structure
- to improve technical infrastructure
- to increase production capacity of products from GE components
- to improve agricultural, health and industrial biotechnology sectors

Specific targets related to agricultural biotechnology were:

- to amend the Biosafety Law and other related legislation
- to determine the rules and principles of allocating “specifically controlled fields” to scientists for Research & Development and field trials

The Biosafety Board is working on the issue of allocation of “specifically controlled fields” to develop principles and rules for controlled fields for Research & Development activities. This is the only agricultural topic from the plan being actively worked on.

MinAF conducted a project with the support of the United Nations Environment Program (UNEP) - Global Environment Facility (GEF) between the years 2013-2017 with the goal to further develop and implement the Biosafety Framework of Turkey in line with its national development priorities and international obligations, especially the Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety. In the scope of this project, MinAF organized training programs on various topics in the area of agricultural biotechnology. The solid outputs of the project were the guidelines developed on: “Application Procedures,” “Risk Assessment of Genetically Engineering Crops and Derived Food and Feed,” “Socio-economic Evaluation Criteria in Decision-Making Process for “GMO” and “GMO Products” which were prepared by the coordination of TAGEM to be used while doing risk and socio-economic assessments. These guidelines are available on the website of Biosafety Clearing-House Mechanism of Turkey at the link: <http://www.tbbdm.gov.tr/Rehber2.aspx>

### *Research*

Turkey’s Biosafety Law permits the regulated study and development of plant biotechnology. However, the cumulative disincentives in the forms of official controls, approvals, liability, and prohibition on the cultivation of agricultural biotechnology have discouraged product development. According to the Law and the implementing regulations, an application or permit is not required for agricultural biotech research. The researcher must inform MinAF TAGEM about the research activity and its result(s). Researchers must apply to TAGEM for permission to import GE material and derived products for the purpose of research, development, and training/educational activities. The amount of GE material and derived products to be imported is determined by TAGEM. The Law requires TAGEM to finalize the permit procedure within 15 days. Many academics agree that the procedures and requirements of the Law discourage research. However, universities are still teaching biotechnology courses. The Law’s prohibition on cultivation and commercialization also discourages the private and public sector from pursuing the development of GE products.

**b. APPROVALS:**

Either the gene-owning technology companies or importers of GE crops may apply for approval of a GE trait in Turkey. Applicants are required to provide a dossier containing technical information and data on the trait to be approved and pay an application fee. The application fee is 23,000 Turkish Lira (TL) (\$ 3,840 where \$1 USD=5, 99 TL) per event in 2018. To date, none of the technology-owning companies have submitted an application to be reviewed by the Biosafety Board. Instead, agriculture industry associations have made the applications.

Currently, there are 36 (10 soybean and 26 corn) events approved in Turkey for feed. Turkey approves stacked events as separate applications. Approvals are officially announced by the Turkish Government in the Official Gazette at the link: <http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr> (in Turkish language).

Please see the current list of approved events given Table-1 below.

**Table-1: Approved Events in Turkey (For Feed)**

No	Product	Developer	Event	OECD Unique Identifier	Approval Date
1	Corn	Syngenta	Bt11	SYN-BTØ11-1	12/24/2011
2	Corn	DuPont Pioneer	DAS1507 (TC1507)	DAS- Ø15Ø7-1	12/24/2011
3	Corn	Dow AgroSciences LLC	DAS59122	DAS-59122-7	12/24/2011
4	Corn	DuPont Pioneer	DAS1507xNK603 (TC1507 X NK603)	DAS-Ø15Ø7-1xMON-ØØ6Ø3-6	12/24/2011
5	Corn	Monsanto	NK603	MON-ØØ6Ø3-6	12/24/2011
6	Corn	Monsanto	NK603 x MON810	MON-ØØ6Ø3-6xMON-ØØ81Ø-6	12/24/2011
7	Corn	Syngenta	GA21	MON-ØØØ21-9	12/24/2011
8	Corn	Monsanto	MON89034	MON-89Ø34-3	12/24/2011
9	Corn	Monsanto	MON89034xNK603	MON-89Ø34-3xMON-ØØ6Ø3-6	12/24/2011
10	Corn	Syngenta	Bt11xGA21	SYN-BTØ11-1xMON-ØØØ21-9	12/24/2011
11	Corn	Pioneer	59122x1507xNK603	DAS-59122-7xDAS-Ø15Ø7xMON-ØØ6Ø3-6	12/24/2011
12	Corn	Dow AgroSciences LLC	DAS1507x59122 (TC1507 X DAS-59122-7)	DAS-Ø15Ø7-1xDAS-59122-7	12/24/2011

13	Corn	Monsanto	MON88017XMON810	MON-88Ø17-3 x MON-ØØ81Ø-6	12/24/2011
14	Corn	Monsanto	MON88017	MON-88Ø17-3	4/21/2012
15	Corn	Monsanto	MON810	MON- ØØ81Ø-6	4/21/2012
16	Corn	Dow AgroSciences LLC	59122xNK603	DAS-59122-7xMON-ØØ6Ø3-6	4/21/2012
17	Corn	Syngenta	MIR604	SYN-IR6Ø4-5	7/16/2015
18	Corn	Monsanto	MON863	MON-ØØ863-5	7/16/2015
19	Corn	Bayer CropScience	T25	ACS-ZMØØ3-2	7/16/2015
20	Corn	Syngenta	Bt11xMIR604	SYN-BTØ11-1x SYN-IR6Ø4-5	11/5/2015
21	Corn	Syngenta	MIR162	SYN-IR162-4	11/5/2015
22	Corn	Syngenta	MIR604xGA21	SYN-IR6Ø4-5xMON-ØØØ21-9	11/5/2015
23	Corn	Monsanto	MON863xMON810	MON-ØØ863-5xMON-ØØ81Ø-6	11/5/2015
24	Corn	Monsanto	MON863xNK603	MON-ØØ863-5xMON-ØØ6Ø3-6	11/5/2015
25	Corn	Monsanto	MON89034xMON88017	MON-89Ø34-3x MON-88Ø17-3	11/5/2015
26	Corn	Monsanto	MON 87460	MON 8746Ø-4	8/2/2017
27	Soybean	Bayer CropScience	A2704-12	ACS-GMØØ5-3	1/1/2011
28	Soybean	Monsanto	MON40-3-2	MON-Ø4Ø32-6	1/1/2011
29	Soybean	Monsanto	MON89788	MON-89788-1	1/1/2011
30	Soybean	Monsanto	MON87701	MON-877Ø1-2	7/16/2015
31	Soybean	Monsanto	MON87701xMON89788	MON-877Ø1-2xMON-89788-1	7/16/2015
32	Soybean	DuPont (Pioneer Hi-Bred International Inc.)	DP356043	DP-356Ø43-5	11/5/2015
33	Soybean	Bayer CropScience	A5547-127	ACS-GMØØ6-4	11/5/2015
34	Soybean	Monsanto	MON 87708	MON-877Ø8-9	8/2/2017
35	Soybean	BASF	CV127	BPS-CV127-9	8/2/2017

36	Soybean	Monsanto	MON87705	MON-877Ø5-6	8/2/2017
----	---------	----------	----------	-------------	----------

**Table-2. Pending Applications (For Feed)**

No	Product	Developer	Event	OECD Unique Identifier	Status
1	Soybean	Monsanto	MON 87769	MON-87769-7	Pending
2	Soybean	DuPont	DP305423	DP-3Ø5423-1	Pending
3	Soybean	Bayer CropScience	FG 72	MST-FGØ72-2	Pending
4	Corn	Monsanto	MON863xMON810xNK603	MON-ØØ863-5 X MON-ØØ81Ø-6 X MON-ØØ6Ø3-6	Pending
5	Corn	Syngenta	Bt11xMIR604xGA21	SYN-BTØ11-1 X SYN-IR6Ø4-5 X MON-ØØØ21-9	Pending
6	Corn	Monsanto	MON89034x1507xMON88017x59122	MON-89Ø34-3 X DAS-Ø15Ø7 X MON-88Ø17-3 X DAS-59122-7	Pending
7	Corn	Monsanto	MON87427	MON-87427-7	Pending
8	Corn	Monsanto	MON89034x1507xNK603	MON-89Ø34-3 X DAS-Ø15Ø7-1 X MON-ØØ6Ø3-6	Pending
9	Corn	Dow AgroSciences LLC	DAS-40278-9	DAS-4Ø278-9	Pending

10	Canola	Monsanto	GT73 (RT73)	MON-ØØØ73-7	Pending
11	Canola	Bayer CropScience	MS8 RF3 MS8xRF3	ACS-BNØØ5-8, ACS-BNØØ3-6, ACS-BNØØ5-8 X ACS-BNØØ3-6	Pending
12	Canola	Bayer CropScience	T45	ACS-BNØØ8-2	Pending
13	Canola	Monsanto	MON 88302	MON-883Ø2-9	Pending

***Timeline of Approvals:***

In 2010, the Turkish Feedmillers Association submitted dossiers applications for three EU-approved soybean events (feed use). The Biosafety Board decided to review the applications under the simplified procedure.

In January 2011, the Turkish Feedmiller's Association submitted applications for 22 corn EU-approved events to the Biosafety Board for feed use and they were reviewed under the regular procedure. The Biosafety Board approved 16 corn events on December 24, 2011 and on April 21, 2012, six corn events were rejected. The Biosafety Board has not published the reason for the rejections.

In January 2011, the Turkish Federation of Food and Beverage Associations submitted applications for all EU-approved soybean, corn, canola, and potato events for food use. However, because of intensive pressure from anti-biotech NGOs and the media, the Federation withdrew the applications for all events for food use. Therefore, currently, there are no approved events for food use in Turkey.

On April 25, 2013, the Board rejected 22 GE corn varieties to be used in the ethanol sector, three GE rapeseed varieties to be used in the feed sector, and one GE sugar beet variety to be used in the feed sector.

Turkish Poultry Meat Producers and Breeders Association (Besd-Bir) submitted dossiers to the Biosafety Board for the approval of a total of 40 traits (10 soybean, 16 corn, four canola and 10 cotton) for feed use in 2015, 2017 and 2018. The Biosafety Board accepted the applications for review under the simplified procedure. Five events (3 corn and 2 soybeans) were approved on July 16, 2015 for feed use. Eight events (6 corn and 2 soybean) were approved on November 5, 2015. Following the coup attempt on July 15, 2016, the Turkish Government declared a State of Emergency, removed thousands of civil servants from their government positions, and seized businesses which had a suspected connection with the organization accused of being behind the coup attempt. The State of Emergency and subsequent dismissals interrupted some government operations and processes, including slowing down the review of biotech trait approvals. The Biosafety Board was again fully staffed and four events (3 soybeans and

1 corn) were approved on August 2, 2017. Besd-Bir withdrew 10 cotton applications in February 2018. As of October 20, 2018, the remaining 13 traits are undergoing assessment. In the meantime, trade has been negatively affected due to unapproved events.

**c. STACKED or PYRAMIDED EVENT APPROVALS:**

Turkey treats stacked events as novel and processes their approval separately from the approval of each individual event in the stack. The Committees follow the same assessment procedures followed for individual events.

**d. FIELD TESTING:**

Currently Turkey does not have any field testing of products derived from agricultural biotechnology. The Law's prohibition on cultivation and commercialization discourages the private and public sector from pursuing the development of GE products. The Biosafety Board was working on the principles for allocating "specifically controlled fields" to scientists for research & development field trials.

**e. INNOVATIVE BIOTECHNOLOGIES:**

Turkey has not determined a regulatory status of innovative biotechnologies in plants or plant products of said biotechnologies.

**f. COEXISTENCE:**

Since the Biosafety Law prohibits the cultivation of agricultural biotechnology, there is no coexistence policy in place in Turkey.

**g. LABELING:**

According to the Biosafety Law and regulations, any imported food or feed containing, consisting, or deriving from GE crops above the labeling threshold set by the Ministry (in January 2011 this threshold was 0.9 percent via an internal Agriculture Ministerial Directive) must be labeled.

Traceability clauses in the Law and implementing regulations require that records be kept for a minimum of 20 years, detailing the unique identifier of the gene, quantity, supplier, and purpose of use, each time a product is processed or handled, from the time of import to the time of distribution to the market. The Turkish government has rolled out a new computer system for recordkeeping and tracking the movement of all GE products. All handlers and users must input detailed information into the system.

The implementing regulations also require that "genetically modified organisms and products thereof are processed and stored in separate production lines. In the event that this is not possible, the production lines and storage facilities must be cleaned by the interested parties in a manner to prevent any contamination with genetically modified organisms and products thereof and the circumstance must be committed to records."

**h. MONITORING and TESTING:**

The testing protocol of the government is not published. There is the potential for every shipment to be tested for GE content and unapproved GE traits.

Posts understanding of the testing process is that the quantitative PCR system is used in Turkey for detecting, identifying, and quantifying GE content. Three main steps are typically followed in GE routine analysis with qPCR methods. First, the potential presence of GE is assessed by a screening approach targeting the most common transgenic elements found in GE such as p35S (35S promoter from cauliflower mosaic virus) and tNOS (nopaline synthase terminator from *Agrobacterium tumefaciens*). According to the positive and negative signals observed for the screening markers tested, GE events potentially detected are identified in a second step using qPCR techniques. Finally, the amount of identified GE events present in the tested food/feed samples is determined. This quantification step is carried out on the basis of the number of copies to allow the simultaneous identification of GE events.

Designated local official laboratories conduct import tests and the National Reference Laboratory in Ankara retests when results are contested. Products that receive a positive detection prior to customs clearance may be sent to another country (provided several conditions are met; please contact FAS/Ankara for more details, as the conditions are fluid). The importer of a shipment found to contain an unapproved trait after clearing customs may be prosecuted for violating the Biosafety Law.

According to the Biosafety Law and its implementing regulation, for the purpose of monitoring GE products placed on the domestic market, the business operator (any person at each stage of business such as importer, distributor, wholesaler, retailer etc.) must submit documents which contain information related to the GE products via a computer system to MinAF and keep the records for 20 years.

#### **i. LOW LEVEL PRESENCE (LLP) POLICY:**

Turkey has a zero tolerance for unapproved LLP in food and industrial products, subject to the liability provisions of the Biosafety Law. On May 29, 2014, MinAF published a change to the regulation to define “contamination” and established a threshold of 0.9 percent for approved genes in their “intended use.” This wording infers that feed is the “intended use” category, because so far only feed use is approved. Because genes are approved only for feed use, the threshold does not provide any utility to detections in food. In practice it seems the 0.9 percent “contamination” allowed refers to the limit allowed of an approved genes not listed on the import documentation as one of the GE genes in that shipment. MinAF has yet to clarify the implementation of the definition or threshold. MinAF intends for the definition and threshold to provide some measure of security from prosecution as “contamination” is unintentional and beyond the control of the domestic party involved (importer, wholesaler, distributor, and retailer).

MinAF follows the approach of the Commission Regulation (EU) No: 619/2011. This legislation allows trace amounts of unapproved biotech content in feed up to a “technical zero” level of 0.1 percent if the trace amount of GE content found is a trait currently being reviewed for approval.

#### **j. ADDITIONAL REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS:**

Article 5(1) (d) of the Biosafety Law prohibits the use of GE and products thereof in baby foods and infant formulas, follow-on formulas, and cereal-based supplementary foods for babies and young children.

Article 3(10) of the Regulation on Genetically Modified Organisms and Products thereof requires MinFAL’s permission for each transit passage of products containing GE content.

**k. INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS (IPR):**

The cultivation of GE crops is prohibited under the Biosafety Law, and so protection for patented seeds does not apply.

**I. CARTAGENA PROTOCOL RATIFICATION:**

Turkey ratified the Cartagena Biosafety Protocol on October 24, 2003 and entered it into force on January 24, 2004. MinAF is responsible for the implementation of the Cartagena Protocol on Biosafety (CPB).

**m. INTERNATIONAL TREATIES and FORUMS:**

Turkey is a member of several international organizations dealing with plant protection and plant health. These include the European and Mediterranean Plant Protection Organization (EPPO), the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), International Plant Protection Convention ( IPPC) and Codex. Turkey is not actively participating in discussions related to GE plant or seed varieties with international organizations. MinAF only participates at the CPB meetings on an irregular basis regarding GE issues.

**n. RELATED ISSUES:**

Turkey's Biosafety Law requires approval for use of products derived from agricultural biotechnology (excluding only pharmaceuticals and cosmetics, which are in the scope of the Ministry of Health). Industrial uses of products derived from plant biotechnology require a separate application and approval.

## PART C: MARKETING

**a. PUBLIC/PRIVATE OPINIONS:**

Due to anti-GE campaigns and one-sided reporting in the media, to include popular health columnists, public and private opinion in Turkey are dominated by misinformation on possible hazards from the consumption of products derived from agricultural biotechnology. There is a widely believed misperception that there is a link between genetic engineering and cancer. The Turkish government rarely refutes misinformation publicly nor clarifies the science and safety behind the crops which are approved for use in Turkey or their approval process.

**b. MARKET ACCEPTANCE/STUDIES:**

The fear of biotechnology by the Turkish public, producers, retailers, and consumers still continues. This is mainly due to anti-GE campaigns run by local and international anti-biotech NGOs such as the Chamber of Agricultural Engineers, Greenpeace and the Friends of the Earth, since 2008. Although public sentiment is resoundingly anti-GE, Turkey is import-dependent for plant-based protein for animal feed.

Misleading health stories, such as claims that eating chicken fed from GE feed has negative health consequences, continued to show up in the media in 2018. However, it appears that consumption of those products has not been affected negatively due to these stories.

To date, Post is unaware of any marketing studies that have evaluated Turkish consumer sentiment towards products derived from agricultural biotechnology. Graham Brookes of PG Economics in Great

Britain published the study “[Economic impacts of the Biosafety Law and Implementing Regulations in Turkey on the Turkish importing and user sectors](#)” in May 2012. The study estimated the cost to the Turkish agricultural sector of Turkey’s restrictive regulatory system for biotech and concluded “...the on-going annual cost can reasonably be expected to be between \$0.7 billion and \$1 billion and could be higher.”

## CHAPTER 2: ANIMAL BIOTECHNOLOGY

### PART D: PRODUCTION AND TRADE

- a. PRODUCT DEVELOPMENT:** Article 5 of the Biosafety Law (Law No: 5977), adopted on March 26, 2010, bans the production of genetically engineered animals and plants.
- b. COMMERCIAL PRODUCTION:** GE animal production is banned.
- c. EXPORTS:** Not applicable
- d. IMPORTS:** The Biosafety Law does not ban GE animal importation. If there were an application, the Board would have the authority to evaluate it though there has not been an application for the import of GE animals.
- e. TRADE BARRIERS:** Not applicable.

### PART E: POLICY

- a. REGULATORY FRAMEWORK:** Turkey’s regulation of agricultural biotechnology is governed by the Biosafety Law (Law No: 5977), adopted on March 26, 2010, and related implementing regulations. Import of transgenic agricultural products (and this applies to GE animals) is only allowed after approval of each event for each use. For more information, please see Section II /Chapter I/ Part B (a).
- b. APPROVALS:** There are no approvals for GE animals.
- c. INNOVATIVE BIOTECHNOLOGIES:** There is no regulatory status of animals or animal products derived from innovative biotechnologies.
- d. LABELING and TRACEABILITY:** Products derived from approved GE animals would require a label indicating that it is or contains GE content.
- e. INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS (IPR):** Not applicable.
- f. INTERNATIONAL TREATIES and FORUMS:** Turkey is a member of World Organization for Animal Health (OIE), and Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), which deals with animal health. Turkey is not actively participating in discussions related to GE animals with international organizations.
- g. RELATED ISSUES:** Not applicable.

## **PART F: MARKETING**

**a. PUBLIC/PRIVATE OPINIONS:** Turkish public opinion is skeptical of benefits from new agricultural technologies in general.

**b. MARKET ACCEPTANCE/STUDIES:**

This is currently not an issue in Turkey so there are no studies on consumer sentiment.

***Further Information:*** For the most up-to-date reports on Turkey's agriculture situation and policies, use the search function at <http://gain.fas.usda.gov/> or visit our website: <http://www.fas.usda.gov/>.